

# **SIMULATION AND ITS DISCONTENTS**

**SHERRY TURKLE**

With additional essays by  
**William J. Clancey, Stefan Helmreich, Yanni A. Loukissas,  
and Natasha Myers**

**The MIT Press  
Cambridge, Massachusetts  
London, England**

© 2009 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

For information about special quantity discounts, please email [special\\_sales@mitpress.mit.edu](mailto:special_sales@mitpress.mit.edu).

This book was set in Scala and Scala Sans by Graphic Composition, Inc., Bogart, Georgia. Printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Simulation and its discontents / Sherry Turkle ; with additional essays by William J.

Clancey . . . [et al.] ; foreword by John Maeda

p. cm. — (Simplicity—design, technology, business, life)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-262-01270-6 (hbk. : alk. paper)

1. Computer simulation. 2. Visualization. 3. Technology—History. 4. Technology—Social aspects. I. Turkle, Sherry.

QA76.9.C65T87 2009

003'.3—dc22

2008035982

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

## INDEX

- Accuracy, confusing with precision, 55
- Advanced Strategic Computer Initiative, 98
- “Aesthetics of construction” (Larsen), 154
- Agnew, Harold, 99
- Anthropomorphization  
of Mars Rover (ROV), 119–120, 121, 125, 126  
of molecules, 182, 188
- Apprenticeship. *See* Master-apprentice relationship
- Architecture. *See also* Architecture and Planning, School of (MIT); Project Athena (MIT)  
computer printouts in, problematic aspects, 15–17, 55–57, 70, 77  
and “falling into the model,” 50–51  
and “fly-throughs,” 50, 53, 57, 63  
hand drawing, architects wanting to preserve, 5–6, 9–10, 15, 29, 43, 47, 53–57, 77, 169  
and negotiations of professional identity in digital culture, 46–57, 78, 153–170  
overconfident use of CAD/CAM in, 51–53  
“ownership” of design in, 14–15, 47–49, 54–55, 57, 77

## INDEX

- Architecture (cont.)  
partnerships in (master/  
apprentice and designer/  
technical expert), 22, 45–46,  
49–51, 154–155, 157–158,  
160–165, 167–170  
in relation to engineering, 18,  
20–23, 67–70, 167
- Architecture and Planning,  
School of (MIT), xii, 10–14, 18–  
19, 20–25, 45–46, 53–54, 78,  
80, 88–89
- Assembly language, 64
- Athena. *See* Project Athena (MIT)
- AutoCAD (Computer-Aided  
Design software applica-  
tion), 23, 163–164. *See also*  
Architecture and Planning,  
School of (MIT); Keepers of the  
Geometry; Project Athena (MIT)
- Banham, Reyner, 160
- “Batch processing,” 11
- Baudrillard, Jean, 93
- Baxter, Nan, 109, 111, 116–117,  
120
- Becoming a Rover (Clancey),  
107–127
- Bernard, H. Russell, 192, 193
- Biltmore, Oscar, 109–110, 112–  
114, 116–122, 125
- Black-boxing, and resistance to,  
26, 31, 33, 41, 44, 59, 63, 67.  
*See also* Transparency
- Bluestone, Jay, 147
- Bolter, Jay David, 87, 195
- Brady, Jim, 174–178, 182–188
- Bryson, Joanna, 178–182
- CAD (Computer-Aided Design).  
*See* Architecture and Planning,  
School of (MIT); AutoCAD;  
CAD/CAM; CATIA; Project  
Athena (MIT)
- CAD/CAM (Computer-Aided  
Design and Computer-Aided  
Manufacturing), 51–53. *See also*  
Calculations  
“back of the envelope,” 4, 36, 43  
hand, 23, 31, 32
- Calculators  
and faculty mourning loss of  
slide rules, 3–4  
students using, 25, 36
- CATIA (Computer-Aided Three-  
Dimensional Interactive  
Application), 46–47, 153–159,  
165, 167–170, 196  
architects learning, 156–157, 159
- The CAVE (Cave Automatic  
Virtual Environment), 72, 75,  
80–82, 99  
called RAVE at Los Alamos, 75, 99
- Chadarevian, Soraya de, 95
- Charles, Peter, 76–77, 79
- “Chastening” simulation, 80–84
- Chemistry. *See* Project Athena  
(MIT)

## INDEX

- Churchill, Winston, 9
- Civil engineering. *See* Project Athena (MIT)
- Clancey, William J., xii, 107–127
- Coen, Enrico S., 199
- Cognition in the Wild* (Hutchins), 194
- Collins, Harry, 91
- Cormant, Thad, 144–148
- Cousteau, Jacques, 129
- Craftpersons, relationship with architects, 52–53, 94, 165–167
- CTD (sensor package measuring Conductivity, Temperature, and Depth), 192
- Cuff, Dana, 153, 160
- “Customization,” of software, 41–42, 67
- Dassault Systemes, 153, 155
- De Architectura* (Vitruvius), 154
- Debugging, 12–13, 21–23, 82. *See also* Errors
- Default settings, seductions of, 14, 47
- Deleuze, Gilles, 201
- Demonstration and simulation versus experiment, 37–42
- Design. *See* Architecture; Architecture and Planning, School of (MIT); AutoCAD; CAD/CAM; CATIA; Keepers of the Geometry; Project Athena, in Department of Civil Engineering; Project Athena, in School of Architecture and Planning
- Designer/hacker couples. *See* Architecture, partnerships in
- Dietrich, Malcolm, 166–167
- “Digital person,” in alliance with an architect. *See* Architecture, partnerships in
- Disneyland, 52
- “Doing and doubting,” tension between, 7, 13–14, 45, 58–64. *See also* Simulation, critical distance and critical stance toward
- Dolan, Ed, 109–110, 114, 122
- Doppler Velocity Log, 146–147
- Downey, Gary, 94, 169
- Drawing. *See* Hand drawing
- Drew, Roberta, 83–84
- Drudgery, useful, 32
- Dumit, Joseph, xii, 85, 87, 91, 100
- Eastwood, Robert L., 194
- Ecologies, deep-sea, 132
- Edwards, Paul N., 87
- Engineering. *See* Becoming a Rover; Intimate Sensing; Project Athena, in Department of Civil Engineering
- The *Enterprise* (*Star Trek* spaceship), 140
- Errors. *See also* Debugging assuming the computer is correcting, 55–56

## INDEX

- Errors (cont.)  
  computer as a generator of “garbage,” 21  
  increasing students’ sensitivity to, 33, 36–37
- Fallon, Burt, 38–39  
“Fly-through” (in architecture), 50, 53, 57, 63
- Foucault, Michel, 169
- Freitag, Lee E., 194
- Freud, Sigmund, 129
- “Frozen ideology,” software as (Mitchell), 169
- Galison, Peter, 95, 168
- The Garden, 12–14, 16. *See also*  
  Project Athena, in School of Architecture and Planning to the CAVE, 80–84
- Gehry, Frank, 22
- Glusker, Jenny, 96
- Goodwin, Charles, 129, 131, 141, 192
- Gordon, Donna, 49–50, 70
- Gordon Research Conferences, 65
- Gorham, David, 35–37
- Griesemer, James K., 198
- Griffin, Diane, 60–63, 66–70, 78–79, 96
- GRIP (Graphics Interaction with Proteins), 65
- Growthiger, program used in civil engineering, 20, 23, 34
- Grusin, Richard, 87, 195
- Guattari, Felix, 201
- Gusterson, Hugh, xii, 85, 87, 91, 98
- Haig, Tom, 168
- Haldane, Rob, 133–134, 138–144
- Hand calculation, virtues of, 23, 31, 32
- Hand drawing  
  architects wanting to preserve, 5–6, 9–10, 15, 29, 43, 47, 53–57, 77, 169  
  as compensation, to “soften” computer printouts, 15, 78  
  and computer drawing, trade-offs between, 160–162  
  details of, signalling completed work, 47, 57  
  and “ownership” of design, 14–15, 47, 55, 57, 77  
  as “sacred space” for architects, 19, 21, 25, 43, 57  
  transparency of, 25
- Haraway, Donna J., 198
- Hayward, Eva Shawn, 142
- Helmreich, Stefan, xii, 129–150
- Hemoglobin, Nobel Prize-winning model of, 60
- Höhler, Sabine, 130
- Hopper, R. L., 136
- “Human-computer lens,” 63, 96
- Hutchins, Edwin, 194
- The hyperreal, 93

## INDEX

- Immersion  
and “intimate sensing,” 141, 150  
the sea as a medium of, 129  
simulations demanding (what  
simulation wants), 3–8, 70,  
73, 80
- Information Technologies and  
Professional Identity (National  
Science Foundation study), xi–  
xiii, 85–86, 91–92
- Initiative on Technology and Self  
(MIT), xii–xiv
- “Inner history” (Turkle), 194
- Interaction metaphors, 97
- Intimate Sensing (Helmreich),  
129–150
- Jerome, Ralph, 165, 167–170. *See*  
*also* Ralph Jerome Architects
- Jet Propulsion Laboratory, 107,  
119, 123, 190
- “Just a tool,” computer as, 18, 47
- Kahn, Louis I., 6, 52, 80, 86
- Kahn, Nathaniel, 86
- Kaiser, David, 171
- Kay, Lily E., 199
- Keepers of the Geometry  
(Loukissas), 153–170
- Keller, Evelyn Fox, 199
- Kendrew, John, 175
- Killworth, Peter D., 192, 193
- Kinney, Tom, 78, 80
- Klug, Aaron, 186
- Knowledge, embodied, 174, 179–  
181
- Laird, Robert, 157, 166
- Langridge, Robert, 65, 200
- Larson, Magali Sarfatti, 154
- Latour, Bruno, 200
- Lawrence Livermore Laboratory,  
72, 74–75, 98
- Leduc, Stéphane, 58
- Leiden, Ralph, 133
- Leucine, visualizing, 178–182
- Levinthal, Cyrus, 177
- Life, early simulations of, 59
- Life sciences. *See also* Performing  
the Protein Fold  
engineering in the, 67–70, 95  
as information-rich and data-  
poor (biology), 68  
and new materiality (biology),  
63, 65–66  
protein crystallography in the,  
59, 63, 65–66, 68–69, 78–79,  
87, 95, 96, 97, 175–176, 187  
simulation and, 58–70, 78–79  
82–84  
simulation as a trusted “error-  
making” machine in, 82–84
- Los Alamos National Laboratory,  
72–76, 98
- Loukissas, Yanni A., xii, 85, 87,  
91–92, 94, 97, 98, 153–170
- Luft, Adam, 73–74, 76, 79–82, 99
- “Lures” (Stengers), 185, 200

## INDEX

- Macgregor, Robin, 196
- Malven, William, 32–35, 39, 60, 90
- “Manual thinking,” 60, 96
- Mars Exploration Rover (MER), 107–127. *See also* Becoming a Rover; Rovers, on Mars
- Master-apprentice relationship, 7, 49–51, 72–74, 154–155, 160–165, 168–170
- McLuhan, Marshall, 150
- Measurement, problems of, 35–37
- MER. *See* Mars Exploration Rover
- Merleau-Ponty, Maurice, 97, 163
- Millennium Bridge (London), 100
- Miller, Geoff, 178
- Mindell, David, xii, 85, 87, 91, 93, 131, 193, 194
- Mitchell, William J., 169, 197
- Models/Modeling. *See* Architecture; CAD/CAM; CATIA; the CAVE; Keepers of the Geometry; Performing the Protein Fold; Project Athena, in Department of Civil Engineering; Project Athena, in School of Architecture and Planning; Simulation
- Mol, Annemarie, 198
- Monterey Bay Aquarium, 131, 135, 142
- Monterey Bay Aquarium Research Institute (MBARI), 131, 136, 140–141, 143, 148–149
- Morgan, Mary S. 200
- Morris, Paul, 156, 159–162, 167–168, 170. *See also* Paul Morris Associates
- Morrison, Margaret, 200
- Mossbauer experiment, 90
- Myers, Natasha, xii, 85, 87, 91–98, 101, 171–188, 198
- NASA, 109, 113
- Nelkin, Dorothy, 86
- Nevada Nuclear Test Site, 71
- Nielsen, Brenda, xii, 85, 89
- “NIH (Not Invented Here),” 156
- Niloff, Barry, 35–39, 64
- Norfleet, Roger, 153
- Nouvel, Jean, 93
- Nuclear testing  
going underground, 72, 74  
U.S. ban on, 71–72
- Nuclear weapons design, role of simulations in, 71–80
- Ocean. *See also* Intimate sensing as alien, 147  
as multimedia experience, 149–150  
as opaque, 130, 149  
“Oceanic feeling” (Freud), 129
- Ochs, Elinor, 187
- The *Opportunity* (Mars ROV), 107–108, 119–120, 190
- Orlov, Mike, 168



## INDEX

- Orsini, M. Stella, xii, 85, 89
- Overmeer, Wim, xii, 85, 89
- Packard, David, 136
- Papert, Seymour, 89
- Pauling, Linus, 185–186
- Paul Morris Associates, 153, 155–165, 196
- Peakfinder, program used in chemistry, 26–27, 34
- Performing the Protein Fold (Myers), 171–188
- “The Protein Folding Problem” (MIT course), 171–188
- and bodywork, 173–175, 179–182, 185–188
- imagining protein folding, 178–182
- modeling by analogy, 182–185
- “motivators” in teaching, 183–185
- performance versus representation, 171
- Perutz, Max, 60, 95
- Pickering, Andrew, 91
- Plato’s cave, 81. *See also* The CAVE
- Point Lobos* (ship), 131–133, 135, 138, 144, 147–148
- Polanyi, Michael, 97
- Porter, William, 196
- Precision, confusing with accuracy, 54–57, 80–82
- Prentice, Rachel, 87, 92, 97, 200
- “Pretty pictures,” seductions of, 76–79
- resistance to, 83
- Project Athena (MIT), development of and resistance to, xi–xiii, 4, 9–42, 46, 50–51, 69, 72, 78, 85, 88–89
- in Department of Chemistry, 25–29
- in Department of Civil Engineering, 13, 20–21, 22–23, 41
- in Department of Physics, 30–42
- in School of Architecture and Planning, 10–19, 20, 21–25, 80
- Project MAC (MIT), 65
- Protein crystallography. *See* Life Sciences, protein crystallography in the
- Quantum-level phenomena, simulations providing access to, 37–42
- Quix, Tim, 153, 156–159, 166, 169–170
- Rabb, Harold, 38
- Rainer, Ned, 109, 113, 118–120, 123
- Ralph Jerome Architects, 165–166
- Ramsen, Howard, 54–56
- Randall, Ted, 15–17, 55, 70, 77
- RAT. *See* Rock Abrasion Tool

## INDEX

- RAVE (at Los Alamos), 75, 99  
“Ray tracing,” 162–163  
The real. *See also* The hyperreal;  
Visualizations, and “visualization/reality blur”  
“messiness of,” 26, 28  
the “out-realing” of, 93  
reverence for, 30–37  
simulations edging out, 16–17, 51–53  
simulations making people feel more in touch with, 27  
what the real wants, 57–58  
“Remediation,” 8, 70, 87, 195  
physicality of today’s modeling systems, 66, 181  
Remotely operated vehicles (ROVs). *See* Rovers, on Mars; Rovers, undersea  
Representations  
deliberately degraded to signal uncertainty, 79  
taking on unjustified authority, 28, 55–57  
Resnick, Mitchel, 90  
Retirement of senior colleagues, anxiety about, 6, 74–76  
Rheinberger, Hans Jörg, 185  
Rhinoceros (3D modeling program), 162–164  
Richardson, H. H., 196–197  
Richman, Arthur, 38–40  
Robena, Tamara, 144–145  
Rock Abrasion Tool (RAT), 108, 115  
Rodin, Nadine, 134–135, 139  
Rovers (ROVs for “remotely operated vehicles”), on Mars  
anthropomorphization of, 119–120, 121, 125, 126  
and the emergence of the “public” scientist, 124  
and identity issues of MER (Mars Exploration Rover) scientists, 109–114, 191, 192  
and negotiations among disciplines on MER project, 110, 122–127  
and space flight, history of, 93–94  
as surrogates, 114–122, 125–126  
Rovers (ROVs for “remotely operated vehicles”), undersea  
and identification of marine scientists with, 130, 141–143, 146  
“inner history” of, 144–149  
and scientists’ sense of self, 131–132, 141  
and similarities to Sony PlayStation, 142  
and users projecting themselves onto, 139, 145  
“Sacred spaces” (of the 1980s) of architects (hand drawing), 19, 21, 25, 43, 57

## INDEX

- of chemists and physicists (lecture halls), 29–30, 44, 89
- of civil engineers (analysis of structures), 29, 43, 69–70
- of physicists (laboratory experiments), 30–31, 39–40, 43
- preserving, efforts toward, 5, 29–30, 44
- reconsidering (in the 2000s), 53–57, 69–70
- Sandia Laboratory, 98
- Schaffer, Simon, 96
- Schön, Donald, xii, 85, 89, 160, 191
- Science fiction metaphors in undersea exploration, 139–140
- Science Operations Working Group, 108, 123
- Screen resolution, issues, 16–17, 57
- The Second Self* (Turkle), 150
- Shales, Rikle, 155–156, 159, 166
- Shapin, Steven, 96
- Silbey, Susan, xii, 85, 91
- SimCity* (game), 10, 88
- Simulation
  - and assertion of core values in physics, 40, 41
  - assumed as the way of the future, 12
  - chastened, 80–84
  - critical distance and critical stance toward, 7, 13–14, 45, 59, 82, 83, 182
  - deference to screen world in, 16–17, 50–57, 70, 78–80
  - and discontents, why focus on, 4–5
  - and “doing and doubting,” 7, 13, 14, 18, 45, 58–64
  - and illusion of preliminary work being “finished,” 24, 47, 56–57
  - and immersion (what simulation wants), 3–8, 70, 73, 80
  - limitations of (as way of knowing), 81–84
  - logic of, overtaking the logic of nature, 69
  - as “necessary evil” in studying quantum-level phenomena, 37–39
  - and nuclear weapons design, role in, 71–80
  - and “ownership” of design in, 14–15, 27, 47–49, 55, 57, 77
  - and possibilities feeling like inevitabilities, 57
  - seductions of, 29, 51–53, 76–79, 80, 83
  - and the true and “true-here,” 17
  - “Simulation-free zones.” *See* “Sacred spaces” (of the 1980s)
- Simulation and Its Discontents (Turkle), 1–101
- Sonar, 136
- Sontag, Susan, xi
- Space Invaders* (game), 31

## INDEX

- Space program
  - history of space flight, 93–94
  - role of simulations in, 190–191
- Space quantization, 34
- The *Spirit* (Mars ROV), 107, 119–121
- Squyres, Steve, 115
- Star Trek* (television program), 140
- Stengers, Isabelle, 185, 200
- Stern-Gerlach experiment, 34, 90
- Students using calculators, 36
  - scientists complaining about, 25
- Styles of approach to computation, 23–29, 66–67
  
- Textbooks, using diagrams and models in, 173
- Thinking with a pencil. *See* Hand drawing
- Thorndike, Drew, 161–165, 167–170
- Tomlin, Marshall, 47–49, 57–58
- Trading zones and cultural divides in architecture, 166–170
- Trainor, Karl, 110–114, 125
- “Transitional objects” (Winnicott), 67
- Transparency
  - aesthetic of, 32
  - associated with understanding, 35, 42
  - of code, 60–63, 73–76, 80
  - of hand drawing, 25
  - of the ocean, 149
  - reassuring aspect of, 35, 73–74
  - shifting meaning of, 44, 157
- Transparency and opacity, tension between, 1–18, 20, 25, 31–35, 44, 60–61, 65, 73–76
- Trilling, Adam, 134–135
- Trueblood, Kenneth, 96
- The “true-here”
  - students’ allegiance to, 17
  - versus the true, 17
- Trumpler, Maria, 171–173
- Turkle, Sherry, xi–xiv, 1–101, 85, 88, 89, 91, 92, 150, 157, 194–195
  
- Van der Waal radii, 178–179, 199
- The *Ventana* (undersea ROV), 135–150
- VICKI (“Video Information Capture with Knowledge Inferencing”), 138
- Video games, students growing up with, 40–41
- Visualizations. *See also* Becoming a Rover; Intimate Sensing; Performing the Protein Fold; Workshops (MIT), on simulation and visualization
  - in chemistry and physics, early, 26–29, 31–34
  - molecular, early, 59

## INDEX

- seductions of, 29, 51–53
- 3D, of molecular structures,  
178–182
- and “visualization/reality blur,”  
52, 93
- Vitruvius, 154
  
- Whitcomb, Louis L., 194
- Whitman, Dean, 82–83
- Winnicott, D. W., 67
- Woodruff, Bettye, 109–113, 118,  
120–121, 124–125
- Workshops (MIT), on simulation  
and visualization, xiii, 61, 86,  
94, 96, 98–101
  
- X-ray diffraction analysis, 60, 62
  
- Yoerger, Dana R., 194

Secularization and Its Discontents Also available from Continuum: Catholic Culture in the USA, John Portmann Fundamen Liberalism and Its Discontents. Aesthetics and Its Discontents. Hidden page Hidden page Hidden page Hidden page Hidden page Hidden page Hidden page Hidden page Hidden Physicalism and its Discontents. Physicalism and Its Discontents Physicalism, a topic that has been central to philosophy of mind and metaphysics in rece...Â SIMULATION AND ITS DISCONTENTS Sherry Turkle WITH DDITI N L E Y BY William J. Clancey, Stefan Helmreich, Yanni A. Louk Progress and Its Discontents. Humao,tlasI Soc,al Sc::lCInCesI Sctancn \$11.95 Events 01 the past two decades have challenged many 01 the lundamental b